

Anette Brunovskis and Rebecca Surtees

Preventing human trafficking

Positive Deviance methodology in practice



DIFFERENT & EQUAL
TE NDRYSHEM & TE BARABARTE



Anette Brunovskis and Rebecca Surtees

Preventing human trafficking
Positive Deviance methodology in practice

© Fafo 2015

ISBN 978-82-324-0207-6 (paper edition)

ISBN 978-82-324-0208-3 (web edition)

ISSN 0801-6143

Cover photo: Colourbox.com

Cover design: Fafo Information office

Printed in Norway by: Allkopi AS

Contents

Acronyms and abbreviations	5
1 Introduction	7
2 What is “Positive Deviance”?	8
2.1 The principles of Positive Deviance	9
2.2 Steps in a Positive Deviance approach	10
3 Positive deviance and trafficking prevention	12
3.1 Previous uses of PD in trafficking prevention.....	12
3.1.1 Example 1: Indonesia	13
3.1.2 Example 2: Nepal	14
4 Positive deviance pilot project: Preventing human trafficking in a town in Albania	15
4.1 About Phase 1 – Identifying PD strategies	16
4.1.1 Selecting the community	16
4.1.2 Engaging with the community and fostering local ownership	16
4.1.3 Conducting a Positive Deviance Inquiry.....	16
4.1.4 Identifying PD strategies	17
4.1.5 Assessing the suitability (and limitations) of PD strategies identified	18
4.2 About Phase 2 - PD project implementation.....	19
4.2.1 Sharing of PD strategies through community meetings	19
4.2.2 Development and dissemination of “Migration and services handbook”	20
4.3 Project results and outcomes	21
4.3.1 Improved trafficking response	21
4.3.2 Mobilisation and community ownership.....	22
4.3.3 Sustainability	22

5 Using positive deviance to prevent trafficking. Some issues and considerations	23
5.1 Considerations linked to the nature of trafficking	23
5.1.1 Addressing trafficking within a safe migration framework	23
5.1.2 Keeping the focus on human trafficking when the community takes ownership	24
5.1.3 Who is at risk? Defining the target group	25
5.1.4 The necessity of including trafficking expertise	25
5.1.5 Ethical, appropriate and safe PD strategies	26
5.1.6 Migration and trafficking is dynamic and ever changing	26
5.2 General considerations in a PD approach	27
5.2.1 The PD approach can be perceived as intangible	27
5.2.2 How to share PD strategies	27
5.2.3 Some at risk groups are hard to reach	28
5.2.4 Engaging positive deviants	28
5.2.5 Community selection; community determines success?	29
6 Replicability and adjustability of positive deviance.....	30
Annotated bibliography of resources for positive deviance methodology	32
Literature and resources on positive deviance	32
Internet-based resources on positive deviance	38
References	40

Acronyms and abbreviations

D&E	Different and Equal
LPKP	Lembaga Pelesenan Kenderaan Perdagangan (Indonesian NGO)
NGO	non-governmental organisation
PD	positive deviance
PDI	positive deviance inquiry
TBU	true but useless

1 Introduction

This document discusses our experiences in developing and implementing a trafficking prevention project in a town in Albania, inspired by and drawing on a particular approach to behavioural and social change called “positive deviance” (PD). It is intended as a resource for practitioners working in the field of trafficking prevention and it is our hope that it can be useful for others who are considering implementing a similar approach or methodology.¹

A positive deviance approach is based on the premise that in every community there are individuals or groups who are in a comparable situation to others (i.e. with similar social and economic resources), who nonetheless manage to find successful strategies and better solutions to a particular problem. A PD approach identifies and mobilises these successful strategies to foster social and behavioural change in the community. Because the PD approach focuses on solutions that have already been identified and mobilised in the community, it holds promise for successful, cost effective and locally grounded trafficking prevention practices.

In this document we share our experiences in using PD in terms of trafficking prevention. The document is structured as follows:

- Section 2 offers an overview of the positive deviance methodology.
- Section 3 outlines potential and previous uses of PD in the trafficking field.
- Section 4 offers a description of our pilot prevention project in Albania.
- Section 5 explores some overarching issues and considerations in using PD to prevent trafficking, highlighting both potential opportunities and also limitations.

Finally, an annotated bibliography offers a list of literature and resources on positive deviance methodology generally, as well as specifically in terms of its application in the field of human trafficking. There is also a listing of Internet based resources.

¹ This document supplements our report *Reframing trafficking prevention. Lessons from a “Positive Deviance” approach* (Brunovskis and Surtees 2015), which was also published in the same project, and to which we would refer readers who are interested in a more comprehensive analysis of positive deviance in the anti-trafficking field, more details about the implementation of our prevention project and our experiences with the methodology. This project was funded by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, for which we are very grateful.

2 What is “Positive Deviance”?

The concept of “positive deviance” (PD) emerged in the 1970s in the field of nutrition research when researchers found that despite poverty in a community, some poor families had well-nourished children. Instead of focusing on what the families of malnourished children were “doing wrong”, the response was to study what the families of well-nourished children were “doing right” and mobilise these strategies in the design of nutrition programmes. Positive deviance was used successfully to improve the nutritional status of children in different countries and has since been applied to a range of different issues including new-born care, rates of contraception, safe sex practices, educational outcomes and so on.

“Positive deviance” is based on the assertion that in every community, at least one person with the same resources and challenges has performed better than others. These individuals are referred to as “positive deviants” – “positive” because they are doing things “right”; “deviants”² because they engage in behaviours that most others do not.

A positive deviance approach identifies and then replicates strategies used by positive deviants to address an existing problem. It focuses on resources and assets that exist and are used in a community to address the issue at hand, rather than focusing on what a community lacks. This approach to problem solving engages community members in looking within their own communities to discover successful and affordable solutions.

Positive deviance behaviours are socially and culturally acceptable and sustainable, given that they are indigenously grown, already proven and successfully practised by “at-risk” persons in the community. In this way, positive deviance inverts common development strategies, which bring solutions from the outside and instead seeks solutions within the affected community.³ In a PD approach, the role of experts is to facilitate in finding positive deviants, identifying the uncommon but effective things that positive deviants do and then making them visible and actionable.⁴

As importantly, the approach reveals at least partial immediate solutions to challenges rather than waiting for long-term development. While planners must also address the complex underlying development challenges (e.g. linked to human trafficking), this ap-

² “Deviance” describes actions or behaviours that violate social norms, including formally enacted rules and laws as well as informal violations of social norms and practice. By implication, “deviants” are individuals who violate these social norms. While the terminology of positive deviant aims to highlight positive actions and behaviours, it should be noted that the term deviance has negative connotations for many people, in many social settings and in different languages.

³ Sparks, D. (2004) ‘From hunger aid to school reform: An interview with Jerry Sternin’, *Journal of Staff Development*, 25(1).

⁴ Pascale, Sternin & Sternin (2010) *The Power of Positive Deviance: How Unlikely Innovators Solve the World’s Toughest Problems*, Harvard Business Press Print.

proach allows for immediate action.⁵ Because the PD approach is about local solutions, it has three important advantages over traditional approaches:

1. Progress is made quickly, without requiring a lot of outside analysis or resources;
2. Resulting benefits can be sustained since the solution originates in the community; and
3. The approach can be broadly applied as positive deviants exist in every community.⁶

In sum, PD is an asset-based approach, which is applied to problems requiring behavioural and social change.

2.1 The principles of Positive Deviance

Positive deviance is based on the following principles:⁷

- *Communities have the solutions.* Community members are experts in their own lives and are best placed to solve their own problems. The community discovers existing uncommon, successful behaviours and strategies. Community members recognise that “someone just like me” can get results, even in the worst-case scenarios. PD is based on respect for the community, its members and its culture and focuses on interactive engagement and capacity, letting the community lead the process.
- *Community organisation.* Communities self-organise and have the human resources and assets to solve an agreed-upon problem. The community designs ways to practice and amplify successful behaviours and strategies and unleashes innovation. All individuals or groups who are part of the problem are also part of the solution and hence the PD process involves all parties who affect the problem. That is, “Don’t do anything about me without me.”
- *Collective intelligence.* Intelligence and know-how is not concentrated in the leadership of a community alone or in external experts, but is distributed throughout the community. The PD process draws out collective intelligence and applies it to a specific problem requiring behaviour or social change. The community creates its own benchmarks and monitors progress.

⁵ Marsh, D., D. Schroeder, K. Dearden, J. Sternin and M. Sternin (2006) ‘The power of positive deviance’, *British Medical Journal*, 329, p. 1178.

⁶ Pascale, Sternin & Sternin (2010) *The Power of Positive Deviance: How Unlikely Innovators Solve the World’s Toughest Problems*, Harvard Business Press Print.

⁷ Outlined by Pascale, Sternin & Sternin (2010) *The Power of Positive Deviance: How Unlikely Innovators Solve the World’s Toughest Problems*, Harvard Business Press Print.

- *Sustainability.* The PD approach enables the community to seek and discover sustainable solutions to a given problem because the demonstrably successful uncommon behaviours are already practiced in that community within the constraints and challenges of the current situation.
- *Practice oriented.* PD focuses on practice and is premised on the belief that it is easier to change behaviour by practicing it rather than knowing about it. That is, “It is easier to act your way into a new way of thinking than think your way into a new way of acting”.

2.2 Steps in a Positive Deviance approach

Implementing a PD project in practice involves partnering with communities, typically in a series of steps:⁸

- Develop case definitions – what is the problem? What would be a better outcome?
- Identify people who have achieved an unexpected good outcome despite high risk
- Interview and observe these people to discover uncommon⁹ behaviours or enabling factors that could explain the good outcome
- Analyse the findings to confirm that the behaviours are uncommon and accessible to those who need to adopt them
- Design behaviour change activities to encourage community adoption of the new behaviours
- Monitor implementation and evaluate the results.

These steps are meant to facilitate three processes – social mobilisation, information gathering and behaviour change, which are detailed below.

- *Social mobilisation.* The community is mobilised around the issue (in our case, of trafficking prevention) and in finding solutions to this issue. The community is motivated by the fact that there are those within the community (positive deviants) that are “doing something right” and that a solution to the problem already exists in the community.
- *Information-gathering.* Information is gathered to identify the behaviours and factors that are likely to account for the good outcome and these positive deviants are accessed to promote good behavioural outcomes (like not being trafficked).

8 Outlined by Marsh, D., D. Schroeder, K. Dearden, J. Sternin and M. Sternin (2006) ‘The power of positive deviance’, *British Medical Journal*, 329.

9 In the context of trafficking prevention it may not necessarily be a precondition that behaviours are uncommon in the community as a whole, but rather, that they are uncommon in or unknown to at-risk sub-populations in the community or among trafficking victims.

- *Behaviour change.* Behaviour is changed in the community through the mobilisation of these PD strategies. Some changes are so accessible that behaviour change occurs quickly and is widespread. Other behaviours change more slowly.

One requirement of the PD approach is that PD strategies be uncommon. While rarer strategies are costly to identify and replicate, more common strategies may not stimulate new thinking and behaviour. It is also necessary to filter strategies and eliminate PD strategies that are “true but useless” (TBUs). TBUs are factors that may contribute to success, but are not accessible to all persons at risk of trafficking and so are useless in solving the problem. For example, if a teacher was successful in teaching reading because she had ten students in her class while other teachers had 20 students, this finding would be “true but useless”. While it is *true* that a smaller class size likely contributed to the teacher's success, it is *useless* because the other teachers cannot reduce their class size.¹⁰ In terms of trafficking prevention, a PD strategy may be to migrate legally through a formal recruitment agency but, in some situations, this may be “true but useless” because it may not be an option for most people, especially those most vulnerable to trafficking.

¹⁰ Sparks, D. (2004) ‘From hunger aid to school reform: An interview with Jerry Sternin’, *Journal of Staff Development*, 25(1).

3 Positive deviance and trafficking prevention

While a lot of funds have been invested in preventing human trafficking in Balkans, the effect of broader prevention approaches, such as information campaigns, are generally quite limited. While such campaigns draw attention to the problem and offer general information about human trafficking, they do not offer alternative strategies for at-risk persons – e.g. in terms of income generation, poverty alleviation, access to resources and support at home or mechanisms to cope within their socio-economic framework. And without alternatives or resiliency strategies in their home communities, many individuals and families do not see any option apart from (often risky) migration. There is a great need to identify factors that protect against unwanted outcomes, whether they be strategies that eliminate the need for migration or that make migration safer.

Much prevention work focuses on those who *were trafficked*, to draw lessons and conclusions from their experiences. By contrast, a PD approach focuses on persons who *have not* been trafficked and the factors that made them less vulnerable to trafficking: Which strategies did they use to prevent being trafficked? Which factors contributed to safe migration? In identifying existing solutions used by “at risk” individuals, this approach potentially offers a method for successful, cost effective and locally grounded prevention practices. Moreover, it can potentially expand the view of prevention beyond that of only awareness-raising to a more systemic approach and, in so doing, offers a theoretical tool and strategy for both community development and counter-trafficking work.

The PD strategy also contrasts in important ways with traditional development strategies, which look “outside” for solutions and largely rely on experts to bring new resources and ideas to a community. Instead, PD finds solutions within the community itself, as described in the previous chapter. This is of particular relevance in the context of human trafficking, which is dynamic and ever changing, with traffickers often adjusting their approaches and tactics in response to the efforts of anti-trafficking actors. The PD approach builds and fosters skills within the community and community leadership in ways that may potentially allow them to adapt their PD strategies to changes in how trafficking takes place.

3.1 Previous uses of PD in trafficking prevention

As a concept, the PD approach is quite simple and has an intuitive appeal. It is focused on solutions and, not least, that these solutions are already available in communities. In

practice, and in the implementation of specific projects, the approach can, however, be more complicated and take many different forms, depending on the topic, field of work and social, economic and cultural contexts. It is therefore useful to describe and discuss the specificities of two previous PD projects on trafficking prevention as a backdrop to this pilot project in Albania.

3.1.1 Example 1: Indonesia

One project in Indonesia used the PD methodology to prevent the trafficking of girls in rural Java from communities with a high prevalence of girls being trafficked into the sex industry. The programme was initiated by Save the Children and the Indonesian NGO LPKP, which piloted the approach in three communities and later replicated and scaled it in 30 communities.

The project team (which included the local NGO) approached and recruited 17 local leaders (cadres) to participate in the project as community volunteers and collaboratively specify and define the problem and work towards its solution. The community volunteers were trained in the PD approach but, because the topic was initially quite sensitive, the PD expert approached the issue generally and then guided the discussion of community problems in a way that led to the identification of child trafficking as a pressing community issue. Once trained, cadres identified families of the same socio-economic class as the families of trafficked girls and interviewed them about their practices and parenting, including how girls could be prevented from being exploited in the sex industry. They identified a number of strategies that PD parents were doing that protected their daughters against trafficking (or “positive deviant strategies”).¹¹ Some strategies were tied to income generation – e.g. diversified crops to be harvested at different times of year to offer greater income stability and supporting daughters in establishing small businesses to supplement the family income. Other strategies including emphasising the value of education (both formal and vocational), discussing the dangers of trafficking and monitoring the jobs and situation of daughters who left the community for work and maintaining close communication.¹²

The community itself, in collaboration with the cadres and the NGO partner, developed a local action plan to mobilise these strategies within the community. This included establishing community “watch groups” (consisting of cadres, PD families, formal and informal leaders and other community members) to monitor known brokers and traffickers and approach families whose daughters were “at-risk” and share various PD strategies and safe migration strategies.

¹¹ Save the children (no date) *Positive Deviance Approach to Preventing Girl Trafficking: a powerpoint presentation*, Indonesia: Save the Children and Durà, L. & A. Singhal (2009) ‘Utilizing a positive deviance approach to reduce girls’ trafficking in Indonesia – asset-based communicative acts that make a difference’, *Journal of Creative Communications*, 4(1), 1-17.

¹² Durà, L. & A. Singhal (2009) ‘Utilizing a positive deviance approach to reduce girls’ trafficking in Indonesia – asset-based communicative acts that make a difference’, *Journal of Creative Communications*, 4(1), 1-17.

An assessment two years later found higher community awareness of trafficking and that no new girls had left the community for the sex industry. It was also reported that there was more openness to discussing trafficking, which had previously been a very sensitive topic. Further, the community had embraced the PD approach as way of addressing other issues in the community and had translated the approach into more general activities, such as the establishment of a girls' youth club and seeking government funding for expanding training opportunities for girls in the community.¹³

3.1.2 Example 2: Nepal

Another application of positive deviance in the anti-trafficking context was in Nepal in 2002, by the Nuwakot District Development Committee with technical support from Save the Children – US. This particular application did not fully implement a PD approach (that is, both identifying PD individuals, families and strategies *and* mobilising these strategies with at-risk populations within the same community). Rather, the project used a “Positive Deviance Inquiry” (PDI) to identify PD strategies to inform an overarching programme response. The core principles of the PD approach were used to inform research methodology and research questions.

In the implementation of the project, staff faced a number of constraints and complications, not the least of which was extreme resistance in many families and communities to openly discussing or even acknowledging human trafficking. Further, the security situation was unstable, due to the Maoist insurgency,¹⁴ preventing researchers from visiting some communities with a high prevalence of trafficking in girls and preventing researchers from completing the PDI.¹⁵ This project points to the potential for drawing on core principles of PD, rather than fully implementing a PD project. It also illustrates that the social, cultural or political environment may not always be conducive to implementing a PD approach, both because of resistance to the issue or, as in this case, because of security concerns.

¹³ Durà, L. & A. Singhal (2009) ‘Utilizing a positive deviance approach to reduce girls’ trafficking in Indonesia – asset-based communicative acts that make a difference’, *Journal of Creative Communications*, 4(1), 1-17.

¹⁴ Between 1996 and 2006, there was an armed conflict between government forces and Maoist fighters. This civil war officially ended in November 2006 with the signing of a peace accord between the two sides

¹⁵ Clawson, V. (2002) *Application of the positive deviance approach to anti-trafficking programming in Nepal – a trial in Nuwakot district*, Nepal: Save the Children.

4 Positive deviance pilot project: Preventing human trafficking in a town in Albania

Because the PD methodology has been used as a means of trafficking prevention on only a few occasions, the overall aim of the PD pilot project was to adapt the methodology and assess its appropriateness for this particular field of work. This chapter describes the implementation of the project in Albania, as an example of how PD might be used in trafficking prevention. The two previous projects that used PD to prevent trafficking specifically targeted child trafficking and, more specifically, the trafficking of girls into the sex industry. This project targeted the trafficking of adults in a South East European context, more specifically in Albania.

This chapter should be viewed in conjunction with chapter 5, which describes some key considerations and adaptations when implementing a PD approach to trafficking prevention. The intention is not to be prescriptive in terms of approach and specific solutions or to suggest that “this way is the only way”. Rather it is to share lessons from the pilot project. One lesson from the implementation of the pilot project in Albania was that the local context, terms of trafficking and migration, culture and social structure, was critical in terms of what was (and what was not) appropriate and possible. Another lesson was the importance of involving an organisation with an expertise in human trafficking. This project was implemented by Different and Equal (D&E), an organisation with extensive experience and competence in human trafficking generally, which added value in different ways, not least because D&E knew how to handle or refer trafficking cases identified during the project (and a number of trafficking victims *were* identified and assisted by D&E as a direct result of the project).

The pilot project was implemented over the course of approximately two years in Albania (2011-2013), in partnership between Fafo, NEXUS and D&E. The project consisted of two main phases, as outlined below:

Phase 1 - Identifying PD strategies. In this phase a project community was identified based on prevalence of trafficking and interest/commitment in addressing the issue. A Positive Deviance Inquiry (PDI) was conducted, to gather and assess information about the local context of trafficking and migration. One goal was to identify PD practices that could form the foundation of safer migration practices in the community. Another goal was to mobilise support and local commitment for the project.

Phase 2 - PD project implementation. In this phase, the PD strategies identified through the PDI were mobilised, in cooperation with the community. A central

component was to agree to and implement locally appropriate and relevant methods for social mobilisation around trafficking prevention and safe migration.

4.1 About Phase 1 – Identifying PD strategies

4.1.1 Selecting the community

The project was implemented in a town in Albania, selected according to the following criteria:

- Known incidence of migration
- Known incidence of human trafficking
- A community that D&E already worked in, were familiar with or had contacts with (to ease access)
- Safety and security considerations for staff and community leaders/members (e.g. presence of traffickers in community)

4.1.2 Engaging with the community and fostering local ownership

The PD approach presupposes that change can and should be locally derived and driven, drawing on local resources and existing strategies. At the outset, a local “gatekeeper” who was respected in the community and willing to support the project was contacted and engaged. She was central in facilitating and smoothing access to community leaders (formal leadership in the municipality and central institutions, as well as civil society representatives). Community leaders were engaged, from the start, to discuss the proposed pilot project including the method, approach and goals. Community leaders were also actively involved in refining the focus of the project, based on their knowledge of the community and who might be considered at-risk of trafficking and/or having been previously trafficked.

4.1.3 Conducting a Positive Deviance Inquiry

A Positive Deviance Inquiry (PDI) was conducted to identify PD strategies and “positive deviants”. Different categories of respondents were interviewed to better understand how migration took place from the community and to clarify potential vulnerabilities and resiliencies amongst migrants. This included interviews with “successful migrants” (those who migrated safely and were not exploited) and “unsuccessful migrants” (those who did not migrate safely and were exploited, including cases of trafficking). Our perspective was that PD strategies that avoided trafficking could be either to migrate safely or to find alternatives to migration. This was part of a broader approach

to trafficking prevention, which does not take a position against migration *per se*, but rather looks to what is needed to keep people safe from trafficking (at home or abroad). This was an important aspect of this approach as, in certain contexts and, as noted above, trafficking prevention often conveys messages of no migration and is often primarily directed at women.¹⁶

In addition, because several respondents (e.g. victims of domestic violence, individuals in need of medical assistance) had unmet assistance needs but little knowledge of where to get help, D&E developed a referral sheet of services in the community to distribute to respondents. This proved to be a useful and welcome tool in communicating with respondents and other community members.

Over the course of the PDI interviews were conducted with migrants, non-migrants and trafficking victims. These included women and men and different ethnicities. The scope was limited to migration to Greece, to permit the identification of more specific and targeted strategies.

4.1.4 Identifying PD strategies

PD strategies identified through the interviews fell broadly into four categories:

1. Preparing for migration in terms of personal resources, timing and the advisability of migration (e.g. language skills, professional skills, cost assessment, etc.);
2. Collecting information about the destination country (knowledge of culture, laws, language);
3. Establishing a social network in the destination country and community, both before going and while away; and
4. Being familiar with and following the legal and institutional framework for migration (e.g. obtaining residence and work permits, knowing where to go for help).

The more specific PD strategies, as described by the community members, were to:

- Have information about the country you are going to

¹⁶ A message of “no migration” as a PD strategy is problematic because migration can be a positive and strategic means of coping with social and economic vulnerability. Moreover, messages of no migration do not address socio-economic vulnerability (including lack of alternatives at home), which puts some people at risk of trafficking. Such messages also do not help individuals make informed choices in situations where they will likely migrate anyway, safely or not. Assessing whether there are alternatives at home to risky migration can either provide an alternative to (risky) migration or help at-risk individuals to reduce their vulnerability and be able to make a more considered choice about where, when and how to migrate. Additionally there is often a focus on women when promoting messages of no migration, indicating a gender bias in terms of who should and should not migrate, which, in some cases, may have negative implications for migrating (and trafficked) women – e.g. being discriminated against or stigmatised for leaving.

- Carefully choose the country that you are migrating to; collect information about the destination country before migrating
- Have knowledge of the culture of the destination country
- Have basic knowledge of the language of the destination country
- Have knowledge of the laws of the destination country and respect them
- Have legal documents – for travel and for work
- Know somebody in the destination country who can assist with housing and finding a job upon arrival
- Have information about services and support in the place where you live and work
- Know the emergency numbers in the place you live (e.g. police, hospital, etc.)
- Learn a profession while away or know a profession before migrating
- Register in an employment office for any job opportunities
- Have information about existing different organisations or associations that can assist you in the destination country
- Keep contact with former employers in the destination country
- Establish and maintain contact with influential persons in the community, like the head of the village
- Make your own evaluation of the costs and benefits of migration; see what you can afford and assess your personal resources before migrating
- Find a network of informal support in the destination community, not only among Albanians, but also Greeks

4.1.5 Assessing the suitability (and limitations) of PD strategies identified

PD strategies were filtered for their suitability; those that were not useful or appropriate were excluded. Some PD strategies were relatively available, such as focussing on building and sustaining relationships and support networks (although even this might not be possible for some of the most vulnerable people). Others, like safe, legal migration, were clearly more complicated as legal migration may not be an option for everyone.

Vulnerability to trafficking may take many different forms and vary greatly. In some cases, trafficking is essentially migration “gone wrong”. At some point, migrants may become vulnerable to exploitation because they do not have access to or knowledge about other alternatives. This may be tackled by addressing these particular issues through a PD approach. For example, one young woman who was deceived by a family member during migration and forced into prostitution might have avoided this exploitation (or escaped earlier) if she knew some of the PD strategies noted above, not least information about assistance and the ability to communicate in the Greek language. As she herself said, she did not know how to escape or where to turn for help: “...I was

obliged to do what [my relative] told me, I did not know the place; I did not know where to go and what to do, I could not communicate because I did not know Greek language. So I was forced to work as a prostitute”.

In other cases, however, vulnerability can be much deeper and most likely only be prevented structurally and with direct interventions. In some cases, victims were trafficked by family members that they were completely dependent on and with little or no influence to make choices for themselves at all. In other cases, socio-economic vulnerability can be so entrenched that being exploited represents the only alternative. This underlines the wide variety of mechanisms involved when people are trafficked and that one singular approach to prevention will not be efficient in all cases.

4.2 About Phase 2 - PD project implementation

Phase two focused on how best to mobilise PD strategies identified during the PDI, in close collaboration with community leaders. This phase was comprised of two components:

1. Sharing of PD strategies through community meetings
2. Development and dissemination of a “Migration and services handbook”

4.2.1 Sharing of PD strategies through community meetings

Community meetings were held and PD strategies were shared with different target groups who were identified as potentially vulnerable to human trafficking and unsafe migration. Each community meeting targeted a specific group assessed to be vulnerable to trafficking and PD strategies and discussions were tailored to their specific experiences, situation and needs.

An “educator” (that is, a community leader or municipal representative) led each community meeting after being trained in the project methodology and positive deviance strategies. “Educators” were selected in consultation with community leaders and represented six different organisations/institutions with relevance for the various target groups. In addition, at each community meeting, one “positive deviant” shared his or her migration experience and positive deviance strategies. Positive deviants were identified during the PDI; they represented different sexes and ethnicities as well as disparate migration experiences. The roles of “educator” and “positive deviants” were voluntary.¹⁷

¹⁷ While a number of positive deviants were identified through the PDI, it was not uncomplicated to mobilise positive deviants. Some positive deviants could not be reached, some having migrated again to Greece. Some did not wish to be involved because of their personal commitments and work responsibilities. Some also may have declined because they did not want to be positioned as a “positive deviant” within their community (although none specifically expressed this reason). In addition, PDs were engaged on a voluntary basis, as D&E staff explained: “But it’s not so easy in Albania to find people who want to be engaged free of charge. Due of course to the financial situation, but this was one of our crite-

Eleven community meetings were held over six months, with a total of 234 participants. Community meetings targeted those deemed as “at-risk”, including different ethnicities (Roma and Albanian), women and men, different ages (adults and youth) as well as different experiences related to employment (unemployed and employed), education (educated and early school leavers) and migration (returned migrants, non-migrants and prospective migrants).

Attempts were made to reach a range of individuals in the community, to ensure that the information was spread broadly. However, some groups were difficult to reach. For example, while students were reached through schools and the youth centre, it was more difficult to contact youth who were school leavers. This was eventually done through the combined efforts of the youth centre staff and the employment office who had a list of unemployed youth and contacted them individually (which in some cases took several attempts and was time consuming). Some youth school leavers agreed to attend the meetings; others did not. This highlights the difficulty in reaching some individuals who might have benefited from this project but who could not be reached, were not interested in participating or did not have the time/opportunity to attend.

A critical feature of community meetings was the sharing of experiences by positive deviants – that is, those who had migrated without being trafficked. Reactions to the positive deviants were largely positive. Many meeting participants described how they most appreciated hearing from past migrants/positive deviants.

4.2.2 Development and dissemination of “Migration and services handbook”

The “Migration and services handbook” was reference material given to participants in community meetings. This written format meant being able to share more information than was possible to cover in community meetings and a resource to which participants could refer later on, as situations arose. A written handbook could also be shared widely within the community, with those who had not attended community meetings but who might also be at risk of trafficking.

The handbook included helpful information in the context of various migration trajectories – i.e. about safe migration and livelihood options as an alternative to (unsafe) migration and assistance to reduce the vulnerability of returning migrants. The handbook was a tool to share PD approaches, as well as to provide much-needed information for vulnerable groups and for prospective and returning migrants. One major finding of the PDI was that the population in the community generally had very limited (and sometimes inaccurate) information that could support safe migration and provide alternative livelihoods to unsafe migration (and thus potentially prevent trafficking). This included: information about safe/formal migration in Greece; services/resources in Greece for migrants facing problems; services in the municipality to improve liveli-

ria, that the people have the will to be engaged, to support and to give some kind of contribution for their own community without expecting anything back”.

hood options; and social/economic support at home as alternatives to unsafe/risky migration.

Information (from the community meetings and the handbook more generally) also reached community members through informal channels, by information sharing with friends and family members by those who had attended community meetings.

4.3 Project results and outcomes

It is difficult to document the extent to which trafficking was prevented by this project or what the long-term impact will be.¹⁸ However, it is possible to document some results and outcomes that have the potential to prevent trafficking in the longer-term. These include an improved trafficking response in the community (preventative and protective), mobilisation and community ownership (not least the institutional response within the municipality) and sustainability of the approach beyond the scope of the project.

4.3.1 Improved trafficking response

One important result was an improved response to human trafficking, which included:

- *Identification and assistance to trafficking victims.* Eight trafficking victims and one person at risk of being trafficked were identified and referred for assistance.
- *Mechanism for future identification and referral.* Contacts and relationships developed between D&E and the municipality can lead to future referral of trafficking victims and consultation when there may be a suspicion of trafficking.
- *Bridge between community and trafficking NGOs.* D&E now has experience in the community, which can assist them in their future anti-trafficking efforts – both prevention and the identification and referral of trafficking victims.
- *Manual included helpful information for many within the community.* The manual included a wide range of resources and information about rights, which is relevant for other (sometimes disadvantaged) groups in the community. This also increased the likelihood that information about services reached trafficking victims, including those who do not recognise their experiences as trafficking.
- *Greater openness to discussion about trafficking.* There is a greater openness to discussing the issue of human trafficking in the community (formally and informally) and

¹⁸ This is different from projects where PD has been traditionally used, where the focus has been to change behaviours that can be concretely measured and documented – e.g. assume feeding practices that lead to better nutrition for children.

greater knowledge of the different forms of human trafficking that occur in Albania, beyond women trafficked for sexual exploitation.

4.3.2 Mobilisation and community ownership

Throughout the pilot project, the project team worked closely with municipal representatives and community leaders. The project was, very early on, embraced by key leaders within the municipality and their commitment to and engagement in the project translated into interest and involvement and commitment from other community leaders. Community leaders and municipal representatives assumed leading roles in project implementation, with the project very quickly embedded within the municipal structure. The long-term, consistent presence of the D&E team in the community was critical in terms of fostering trust and confidence from community leaders and community members.

The project has been followed by a structural commitment to continue developing efforts to prevent trafficking and foster safe migration and an increased awareness of the issue at political and operational levels in the municipality. In the longer-term, this has the potential to contribute to trafficking prevention at a structural (local) level, as approaches developed in the project become integrated into the local response and approach to migration and trafficking prevention.

The project also opened up a space to talk about trafficking and for exchanging experiences (good and bad). This is a potentially important element both in trafficking prevention and in fostering safe migration, as it may provide an opportunity to learn from the experiences of others, not least in an environment where migration is highly prevalent. It may also mean that more exploited migrants may be able to accurately assess if their experiences were in fact trafficking experiences (and be able to seek out support as needed).

4.3.3 Sustainability

Community activities continued beyond the pilot project, which is clearly related to the local ownership of and commitment to the approach and project. D&E scaled back its presence in the community at the end of the pilot project, but continued to monitor activities related to the PD project for several months afterward, to assess to what activities would continue and to what extent the PD approach had taken root. In this time, community leaders and municipal representatives took advantage of a number of public/community events to further disseminate the PD strategies from the project and the handbook. The municipality also presented the project and handbook at international and national events and integrated the handbook and PD strategies into municipal activities and institutions beyond the pilot project period.

5 Using positive deviance to prevent trafficking. Some issues and considerations

PD is a potentially useful framework for working with a community over time. At the same time, PD was developed in the context of nutrition and health and tackling the complex social and economic issue of human trafficking involves making adjustments to this approach. In the process of implementing this pilot project in Albania a number of adjustments and observations were made. These form the basis of the following considerations, which should be taken into account if using this methodology in this particular field. Some considerations are specifically linked to the complex and sensitive nature of human trafficking and how this influences (as well as limits) the ways in which a PD approach to prevention can be used. Other considerations are more general observations about the PD approach.

5.1 Considerations linked to the nature of trafficking

The following issues and considerations relate to specific features of trafficking and migration, not least that human trafficking is diverse, complex and a highly sensitive issue.

5.1.1 Addressing trafficking within a safe migration framework

It may be useful to frame trafficking prevention within a broader and less sensitive framework. Raising the issue of trafficking head on with a community can create resistance to the project and interfere with the ultimate goal of trafficking prevention. There was varied openness to acknowledging and discussing trafficking in the community where this pilot project was implemented, particularly in the early stages of the PDI and the project. This was also an issue in the context the two other previously mentioned projects that used a PD approach to trafficking prevention in Nepal and in Indonesia.¹⁹ In our project the overall goal of trafficking prevention was integrated into a

¹⁹ In Nepal the project team reported an extreme reluctance to openly discussing trafficking, which complicated the process of mapping possible PD strategies for trafficking prevention. Clawson, V. (2002) *Application of the positive deviance approach to anti-trafficking programming in Nepal – a trial in Nuwakot district*, Nepal: Save the Children. In Indonesia, initial discussions with the community were framed quite broadly, precisely to avoid negative reactions if tackling such a sensitive issue (trafficking of girls into the sex industry) head on. Sternin, J. (2003) *Workshop/Meeting with LPKP Staff and Village Cadres*.

more general (and less sensitive) framework of safe migration. This had several advantages.

A broader framework facilitated more openness to the issue, particularly in a community where migration is normative and also, to some extent, socially valued. Safe migration was also perceived as relevant for more people and institutions than a focus solely on human trafficking. This is especially critical in a context where trafficking is generally perceived to be only the trafficking of women and girls for prostitution, with less focus on and knowledge about men and women being trafficked for labour or men being trafficked at all.

Further, it increases the likelihood of reaching potential (and former) trafficking victims in efforts to mobilise the community, as potential victims cannot be identified directly, but will likely be found within a broader group of prospective migrants. This also addresses the issue of trafficking victims who may not have recognised their experiences as trafficking (and, thus, are unable to identify with trafficking prevention paradigms) but rather see their experience as failed migration or exploitation.

Framing trafficking prevention within a safe migration approach also offset the potential for stigmatisation of project participants. As trafficking for sexual exploitation (but also potentially for labour) continues to be stigmatised in Albania (and in many countries), great care must be taken not to target potential at-risk groups in ways that identify them in the local community and translate into discrimination, stigmatisation or even violence.

5.1.2 Keeping the focus on human trafficking when the community takes ownership

In choosing to integrate trafficking prevention in a broader safe migration framework, the project can be opened to be about migration more generally. And, in this more general migration framework, there may be other issues (beyond trafficking prevention) that are perceived as equally (if not more) important by some community members. It can, therefore, be a challenge to keep the original focus as an objective.

In this project, one such issue was the situation of returned migrant families and particularly their (school age) children in reintegrating in the community. This was not a group initially identified as especially relevant in a trafficking *prevention* context. Nevertheless, it was of such concern to a number of community members that a full section of the migration and services handbook was dedicated to meeting the needs of returned migrants in the community.

In this case, this did not detract from the overall goal of trafficking prevention. Indeed, the inclusion of material and topics that are broadly relevant in the community may contribute to a wider dissemination of the project material and create a greater interest in participating in the project. Nonetheless, it is necessary in a project such as this to strike a balance between the intentions of the project and be aware of where the focus turns when the community takes ownership of the process. This may not always be straightforward.

5.1.3 Who is at risk? Defining the target group

When using a PD approach for trafficking prevention, it is necessary to first define those who are at risk of trafficking and then, within this group, further identify positive deviants (that is, those who have the same resources and are similarly at risk but don't end up trafficked). However, this requires that there is a clearly defined group of people who are at risk and, equally, that project implementers and community leaders are in a position to identify them. The extent to which this is the case is an open question and differs substantially according to context.

Importantly, community leaders and members may not be sufficiently informed about human trafficking to make a sound assessment of who is and is not at risk (as well as what would be positive deviant strategies that would prevent trafficking). And while some community leaders may be aware of more typical forms of trafficking (e.g. women and girls trafficked for sexual exploitation), they may be less aware of the possibility that men and boys may also be trafficked and also that some people are trafficked for forced labour, street selling and begging, crime and delinquency and so on.

Stigmatisation of trafficking victims (and social resistance to the issue) may also mean that some community leaders are unwilling to recognise this issue within the community and engage in a trafficking prevention programme, not least because they fear it will bring shame on their community. In this pilot project, there was a certain resistance among some community leaders (and, arguably, by extension within the community at large) to acknowledge trafficking as a problem in the community.²⁰ Had this resistance been more pronounced and on-going over time, this would have been a significant impediment.

5.1.4 The necessity of including trafficking expertise

PD projects often involve PD experts partnering with an organisation already working within a community because it facilitates access to the community and draws on local knowledge. However, this is also likely to mean that the organisation will not have experience in and substantial knowledge of human trafficking and human trafficking interventions. The alternative is to engage with an anti-trafficking organisation, which may not be based in the community. This is important for various reasons including:

- Having experience with and sensitivity in relations and communication with trafficking victims who may be identified over the course of the project;
- Being well positioned to identify and refer (or directly assist if the organisation is also a service provider) trafficking victims whose cases come to light over the course of the project;
- Ensuring that the project is in line with ethical standards for working with trafficking victims and safeguarding against any unwanted or even harmful consequences; and

²⁰ This is consistent with our past experiences working on human trafficking in Albania and an issue that D&E highlighted as critically important in terms of working on the issue.

- Not implementing inappropriate responses to human trafficking – e.g. aiming to curb women’s migration, failing to refer cases in need of assistance, failing to recognise cases of male trafficking or trafficking for forced labour and so on.

An implementing organisation that is specialised in human trafficking but not based in the community requires adjustments such as taking time to learn about the community, building relationships with community leaders and members, being present in the community over time, engaging and working through local gatekeepers and so on. It will also be important to take the time to assess whether any safety and security issues may arise (for staff or participants) during the project.

5.1.5 Ethical, appropriate and safe PD strategies

A major concern and consideration is to ensure that any PD strategy is ethical in that it does not infringe on anyone’s human and civil rights. This can be of concern, for example, in terms of identifying PD strategies related to safe migration. In some situations, safe migration programmes have essentially meant no migration, which is not realistic, appropriate or ethical. Given the vulnerability and risk involved in irregular migration, it may also be important to avoid strategies that facilitate or promote illegal migration. It is necessary to measure each PD strategy and pilot project approaches against not only the practical solutions being used/proposed, but also against this ethical yardstick.

On a similar note, difficult questions may arise in the process of the community identifying positive deviant strategies generally. While the PD strategies should arise from and be anchored in the local community and be both feasible and acceptable locally, it is still important to ensure that PD strategies do not breach basic human or civil rights. For instance, in one area researched for a former study on trafficking, one strategy used by parents to prevent trafficking was to keep young girls from attending school, (out of a fear of kidnappings). While this might have been “socially acceptable” in that particular context (where many people shared a fear of harm befalling their daughters), this would clearly not be an acceptable positive deviant strategy. Given the prevalence of efforts to prevent trafficking by encouraging or sometimes even actively stopping, migration (particularly for women) it is worth bearing in mind that local ideas and solutions to preventing trafficking are not always ethically sound or acceptable.

5.1.6 Migration and trafficking is dynamic and ever changing

One complicating factor when applying the PD approach to trafficking prevention is that trafficking and migration may fluctuate and change over time, both in prevalence and in how they take place. This can compromise the sustainability of specific PD strategies, as their relevance may also substantially change as migration and trafficking patterns change. This is something that occurred even over the limited time period during which the pilot project was implemented. The situation at the time of the project was fast changing – e.g. the economic crisis in Greece meant many Albanian migrants were unable to find work in Greece, while at the same time, visa liberalisation meant that they

were able to travel legally within the Schengen area for three months. This means, in practice, that PD strategies need to be up to date (and regularly updated) to mesh with the current ways that trafficking is playing out.

5.2 General considerations in a PD approach

The considerations outlined above relate to specific features of trafficking and migration, and not least the particularly sensitive nature of human trafficking. There are also more general issues and considerations of the PD approach, which are explored below.

5.2.1 The PD approach can be perceived as intangible

In many ways the PD method is simple and straightforward. And yet, in practice, many community members found it quite intangible. For example, when the pilot project was first introduced in the municipality, one state representative was perplexed as to what this project really was, finding it unclear and hard to grasp relative to the large infrastructure projects he was used to. Having an actual output from the project (that is, the Migration and services handbook) was very useful in terms of making the project more concrete and tangible.

The handbook remains in the community beyond the implementation of the pilot project. It can be (and has been) reproduced in parts for different audiences and in different settings. And it also filled an important information gap, which could go some way in terms of contributing to addressing vulnerability (and, arguably, trafficking vulnerability). The handbook has further institutionalised the PD strategies being shared through community meetings as it has been integrated in the work of several municipal bodies, contributing greatly to the sustainability of the project.

5.2.2 How to share PD strategies

One central consideration is how to share and mobilise PD strategies. There may be different ways of mobilising PD strategies and, while one concern is that they be efficient, they must also be locally appropriate. The project team, in collaboration with the community leaders, chose to conduct community meetings rather than targeting at risk families one-on-one, as was the approach in the Indonesia PD trafficking prevention programme. This was done because:

1. Given the breadth of migration and trafficking experiences and the hidden nature of trafficking in the community, it was difficult to target specific individuals or families with any real degree of accuracy (for the reasons discussed earlier); and
2. Targeting individuals had the potential to be alienating in ways that might lead to resistance to the messages and hostility to the “messengers”, including the positive deviant involved.

5.2.3 Some at risk groups are hard to reach

At the core of the PD approach is the goal of reaching individuals who are at risk for the unwanted outcome, in order to make available to them solutions that others have already successfully used. In the case of trafficking, it can be difficult to correctly and precisely identify at-risk groups and individuals in a community. An additional limitation is that even if identified, at-risk groups may not necessarily be easy to reach and engage.

In the pilot project, attempts were made to reach a wide number of individuals in the community, to ensure that the information was spread broadly. However, some groups – e.g. school leavers – were more difficult to reach than others, as discussed above. While this group was eventually reached it required concerted effort from the youth centre staff and cooperation from the employment office in providing contacts for unemployed youth. This highlights that some individuals (arguably those most in need of the information) may be harder to reach and, in addition, may not always be interested in participating or have the time/opportunity to attend.

Another example was one particular group of women who wished to be paid to participate in the community, as some projects do pay participants for their time when attending community meetings. This, however, would not have been consistent with the underlying principles of a PD approach, which ultimately meant not reaching this group of women. Some individuals (or even whole groups) may be missed because they do not see the value in discussing a particular topic or the way that information is disseminated. This further endorses the value of multiple mediums for the sharing of PD strategies – i.e. the handbook as well as the community meetings; the larger community events as well as targeted community meetings.

5.2.4 Engaging positive deviants

It can be complicated to mobilise positive deviants. In this project, some positive deviants could not be reached. Some had since re-migrated to Greece. Others were unable to be involved because of their personal commitments and work responsibilities, including, in some cases, the need to earn money to support their families. Some may also have declined because they did not want to be positioned as a “positive deviant” within their community. Although none specifically gave this reason, this was the impression of project staff.

A critical feature of community meetings was the sharing of experiences by positive deviants – that is, those who had migrated successfully. Reactions to PDs were largely positive; meeting participants appreciated positive deviants sharing their migration experiences. Nonetheless, this approach – of one person being held up as the example to others – also has the potential to be met with negative reactions. Thus, it seems important to consider in more detail the not uncomplicated category of “positive deviant” including how this role is experienced by positive deviants themselves.

5.2.5 Community selection; community determines success?

One key aspect of the project was the involvement and commitment of community leaders. This project was introduced to community leadership by a gatekeeper who was well respected and trusted by the community leadership. This individual was active throughout the duration of the project - in contacting community leaders, contacting relevant community members and was an enormous source of information in terms of developing the referral sheets and manual.

This support even went beyond the scope of the project. After the pilot project ended, this gatekeeper set up “extra” meetings with select professional groups who come into regular contact with the various target groups and who were well positioned to disseminate the handbook and the PD strategies (e.g. law enforcement, teachers, school psychologists, health workers, child protection staff, youth centre staff, etc.). These meetings were not always easy to arrange and required concerted efforts – i.e. by contacting them time after time by phone and also meeting them personally in their places of work. This highlights again the integral role that the primary gatekeeper played in the project and the possibility of less success had a community-based representative not been as involved and supportive.

Important questions thus arise as to whether and to what extent the project would have been successful had different conditions existed in terms of community interlocutors. Also important is the issue of security for persons involved with the project, vis-à-vis traffickers within the community, who may perceive the project as a threat to their business. Such an approach may not be feasible in environments where traffickers are more powerful and/or violent.

6 Replicability and adjustability of positive deviance

An overarching goal of this project was to assess, through practice and analysis, the usefulness of a PD approach in trafficking prevention and to explore how the methodology might be adapted to address the complex and disparate issue of human trafficking in other communities and contexts.

Most useful as a resource in preventing human trafficking is the PD perspective itself, which changes how an issue is framed. That is, PD looks for existing solutions and who is already “doing it right”, rather than to the problem and those who have “failed”. Thus, there is space for mobilising a PD approach in preventing trafficking or, at least, in integrating elements from the PD approach and perspective in anti-trafficking prevention activities and projects.

In terms of the replicability of a PD methodology or approach in the field of human trafficking, one consideration is about resources. A PD approach is labour intensive and time consuming and requires resources from PD specialists as well as the community at large. As such, it is useful to consider PD along a spectrum from which different aspects and elements can be useful. That is, using PD in trafficking prevention can entail anything from full project implementation, to using various elements and components. These might include:

- Using the principles and perspective of PD – that is, identifying local specific resources and learning from positive experiences.
- Use the approach of “positive deviants” sharing experiences in a more *ad hoc* manner and not necessarily as part of a larger project. This is a way of working practically with trafficking prevention in smaller contexts without necessarily implementing a full PD programme or project.
- Preparing tools derived from PD learning that can have wide and long-term reach. A critical aspect of this project was the Migrants and services handbook. While the development of the manual in its full form was labour intensive, it is also possible to consider less comprehensive variations of this type of output targeted to trafficking prevention and safe migration.

And there may be several other ways of integrating PD with anti-trafficking work generally, and prevention specifically. Based on the experiences of this project, we believe that the PD approach can contribute to preventing trafficking at the individual level in certain types of cases, especially when vulnerability occurs at least partly through a lack of information about available resources, alternative paths of action or how to migrate safely. In other cases, however, trafficking occurs in the context of a much deeper, structural vulnerability, where individuals may have very limited control to make alterna-

tive choices even if they are provided with more knowledge. Trafficking prevention can, thus, not only be thought of from an individual perspective, but must also be addressed structurally in terms of reducing social and economic vulnerability. This is where the adaptation in this project (to include both individuals in the community *and* to work closely with local institutions, such as the municipality and the police) is of particular importance and one that merits replication in future projects. Strengthening of the community structures should, in the long-term, also offer greater protections for socially vulnerable persons including those at risk of trafficking. It is also essential in terms of sustainability of the project.

Finally, when considering replicability it is important to note that ultimately a positive deviance approach to trafficking prevention aims to change behaviour. And, this typically means the behaviours of trafficking victims. Perhaps the more noteworthy “limitation” in this approach, therefore, is precisely in situations where changes in victims’ behaviours would not have translated into greater protection or safety. That is, many migrants follow similar migration pathways, with only some ending up trafficked. It is the exploitation of their vulnerability that is the difference in such cases. This, in turn, means that there are limits to what behaviour change approaches like PD can do to prevent trafficking. We would also caution more broadly that future trafficking prevention efforts increasingly consider to what extent trafficking victims rather than traffickers themselves should be targeted for changes in their behaviours.

Annotated bibliography of resources for positive deviance methodology

Below is a list of literature and resources on positive deviance methodology generally as well as specifically in terms of its application in the field of human trafficking. Also included is a listing of Internet based resources.

Literature and resources on positive deviance

Clawson, Victoria (2002) *Application of the Positive Deviance Approach to Anti-Trafficking Programming in Nepal - A Trial in Nuwakot District, Save the Children.*

Summary: “In July 2002, the Nuwakot District Development Committee (DDC), with technical support from Save the Children – US (SC-US), attempted to conduct a Positive Deviance Inquiry (PDI) to develop improved programming to combat the trafficking of girls for commercial sexual exploitation. This inquiry was to take place in five Village Development Committees (VDCs) in Nuwakot District: Rauthbesi, Sikharbesi, Ghyangphedi, Gaukharka and Talakhu. Unfortunately, midway through the process, Maoist rebels interfered and made it impossible to continue the PDI safely in four of the five VDCs, with the full process completed only in Talakhu VDC. Nonetheless, extensive groundwork was completed for the PDI, including the development and implementation of a program to train researchers in the PD Approach and its application in the field of anti-trafficking. In addition, the DDC research team did manage to complete a small-scale situation analysis in all VDCs, which had been meant to lay the foundation for the ensuing PDI. Finally, the technical team gained insight into the application of the PD Approach to the anti-trafficking field during the implementation of the PDI in Talakhu. While the Nuwakot DDC and SC-US were disappointed at not being able to complete this promising process at this time, both groups felt it would be useful to record the process used to train and prepare for a PDI in the field of trafficking, to present the results of the situation analysis, and to present the results of the PDI for Talakhu, the one VDC where the process was completed. This report attempts to do all three of these.”

Durà, Lucía and Singhal, Arvind (2009) ‘Utilizing a positive deviance approach to reduce girls’ trafficking in Indonesia – asset-based communicative acts that make a difference’, *Journal of Creative Communications*, 4(1), 1-17. Available at: http://www.positivedeviance.org/projects/Singhal-Dura-PD-Save-Comparative-Rpt-October_23,_2008.pdf

Abstract: “This article analyses the communicative practices that undergird the Positive Deviance approach to social change and its contributions to the curbing of girls’ trafficking in rural Indonesia. Positive Deviance hinges on the premise that in every community there are individuals whose uncommon practices enable them to find better solutions to problems than their neighbours with access to the same resources. Archival and field research in Indonesia indicates that Positive Deviance is time and skills intensive, yet it is also rich in communication and relational practices. It facilitates a unique vantage point to build human capital and sustain positive impacts.”

Lapping, K., D. Marsh, J. Rosenbaum, E. Swedberg, J. Sternin, M. Sternin and D. Schroeder (2002) ‘The positive deviance approach: Challenges and opportunities for the future’, *Food and Nutrition Bulletin*, 23(4), 128-135.

Abstract: “The positive deviance (PD) approach offers an alternative to needs-based approaches for development. The “traditional” application of the PD approach for childhood malnutrition involves studying children who grow well despite adversity, identifying uncommon, model practices among PD families, and designing an intervention to transfer these behaviours to the mothers of malnourished children. A common intervention for child malnutrition, the so-called “hearth,” brings mothers together to practice new feeding and caring behaviours under the encouragement of a village volunteer. Hearths probably work because they modify unmeasured behavioural determinants and unmonitored behaviours, which, in turn, result in better child growth. Some health outcomes require a better understanding of behavioural determinants and are not best served by hearth-like facilitated group skills-building. This article shares early experience with the PD approach for HIV/AIDS and food security. The attributable benefit of the PD approach within a program has not been quantified, but the authors suspect that it is a catalyst that accelerates change through the processes of community attention getting, awareness raising, problem-solving, motivating for behaviour change, advocacy, and actual adopting new behaviours. Program-learners should consider identifying and explicitly attempting to modify the determinants of critical behaviour(s), even if the desired outcome is a change in health status that depends on multiple behaviours; measure and maintain program quality, especially at scale; and creatively expand and test additional roles for PD within a given program.”

Marsh, D., D. Schroeder, K. Dearden, J. Sternin and M. Sternin (2006) ‘The power of positive deviance’, *BMJ*, 329, 1177-1179.

Summary: In this article the authors argue that the most efficient way to improve health is to use locally available, sustainable, and effective approaches: “In the 1970s, policy developers tested the concept that public health interventions could be designed around uncommon, beneficial health behaviours that some community members already prac-

tised. This concept, known as positive deviance, was used successfully to improve the nutritional status of children in several settings in the 1990s. Recently, the approach has also been applied to new-born care, child nutrition, rates of contraception, safe sexual practices, and educational outcomes.” In this article the authors describe how the approach works, the evidence that it is effective, and possible future applications.

Marshall, Phil (2011) *Re-thinking Trafficking Prevention: A Guide to Applying Behaviour Theory*, Research Communications Group, ADB & UNIAP.

Summary: “The term “prevention” is used to describe a range of anti-trafficking interventions and has accounted for a large proportion of the investment in anti-trafficking. In source-based efforts to reduce vulnerability and migration, there are a host of awareness-raising activities, microcredit schemes, vocational training, community protection networks, programmes to increase school attendance, and even the building of wells in rural communities to reduce seasonal migration. At destinations, further awareness-raising efforts, emerging campaigns targeting consumers, migrant hotlines, and workplace inspections exist. Governments and other actors have also attempted to prevent trafficking in transit through strengthened border controls, restrictions on movement, particularly of young women and girls, and out-reach services for potentially vulnerable migrants in border areas, boat and bus terminals. This paper seeks to highlight the potential advantages of defining prevention activities in behavioural terms, demonstrating the benefits of behavioural theory, developed and refined in other fields, as a basis for stronger programme design and evaluation in the anti-trafficking sector. It will not provide extensive detail on behavioural theory, on which there is much documentation, but seeks to present core ideas in broad terms to anti-trafficking practitioners.”

Pascale, R., J. Sternin and M. Sternin (2010) *The Power of Positive Deviance: How Unlikely Innovators Solve the World's Toughest Problems*, United States: Harvard Business Press.

Summary: In this book, the authors present a counterintuitive new approach to problem-solving. The authors suggest leveraging positive deviants: the few individuals in a group who find unique ways to look at, and overcome, seemingly insoluble difficulties. By seeing solutions where others don't, positive deviants spread and sustain needed change. With first-hand stories of how positive deviance has alleviated some of the world's toughest problems (for example, malnutrition in Vietnam, staph infections in hospitals), the authors illuminate its core practices, including: 1) Mobilizing communities to discover "invisible" solutions in their midst; 2) Using innovative designs to "act" your way into a new way of thinking instead of thinking your way into a new way of acting; and 3) Confounding the organizational "immune response" seeking to sustain the status quo. (Harvard Business Review, June 16, 2010)

Save the Children (no date) *Positive Deviance Approach to Preventing Girl Trafficking: Powerpoint Presentation*. Indonesia: Save the Children. Available at: http://www.powershow.com/view/8df0-ZjM2Y/POSITIVE_DEVIANCE_APPROACH_for_PREVENTING_GIRL_TRAFFICKING_powerpoint_ppt_presentation

Summary: This power point presentation discusses Save the Children's Anti-Trafficking Initiative, which utilizes a positive deviance approach to identify and build on successful strategies that already exist in the community. The presentation details the preliminary steps of utilizing a positive deviance approach, including determining the presence of positive deviants and determinant factors, strategies and practices within the positive deviance approach, the formation of community watch communities, and the results of the project to date.

Save the Children (no date) *Preventing Girl Trafficking Indonesia*, Indonesia: Save the Children. Available at:

http://www.positivedeviance.org/projects/vulnerable_groups.html?id=126

Summary: "In 2008, researchers returned to Indonesia to evaluate the results of a PD program run by Save the Children and a local Indonesian NGO to decrease the number of girls trafficked into the sex trade. The program identified at risk families and offered counselling from community volunteers in practices that could help them keep their daughters safe. In the village conducting the pilot program they found: 1) No new girls had left the village to enter the sex trade; 2) The taboo around the sex trade was broken; and 3) PD was being used to address other problems in the community."

Singhal, Arvind and Lucia Dura (2009) *Protecting Children from Exploitation and Trafficking: Using the Positive Deviance Approach in Uganda and Indonesia*. Save the Children.

Summary: "Some girls in conflict-ridden Northern Uganda resort to transactional sex to have a mat to sleep on at night. And with the prospect of earning more money in a day than their parents might make in a month, many girls in East Java, Indonesia fall into work in the sex industry. Children face sexual exploitation worldwide, especially when they have little support to avoid them, have few skills that give them options, and little sense of their own value and possible alternative futures. The Positive Deviance approach to social change finds solutions to common problems in the behaviours of positive outliers—those who defy the worst odds in the face of seemingly intractable problems and present social proof that local and actionable solutions to those problems are equally available to their peers. This monograph documents two child protection projects implemented by Save the Children using the Positive Deviance approach."

Sparks, D. (2004) 'From hunger aid to school reform: An interview with Jerry Sternin', *Journal of Staff Development*, 25(1). Available at: <http://www.nsd.org/library/publications/jsd/sternin251.cfm>

Summary: "This interview with Jerry Sternin, a visiting scholar at Tufts University and an international consultant who is involved in Positive Deviance projects for the World

Bank in Argentina and for USAID-funded development organizations in Indonesia, discusses the definition of a positive deviant and clarifies some of the underlying beliefs that support the value of the Positive Deviance Approach. Jerry Sternin recently presented the Positive Deviance approach to corporate and social entrepreneurs at the World Economic Forum in Geneva.”

Sternin, Jerry (2003) ‘Practice Positive Deviance for Extraordinary Social and Organizational Change’, in Ulrich, D., M. Goldsmith, L. Carter, J. Bolt and N. Smallwod (Eds.) *The Change Champion's Fieldguide: Strategies and Tools for Leading Change in Your Organization*, Best Practice Publications.

Summary: “In this chapter, Jerry Sternin, widely known as “the father of applied Positive Deviance”, explains the story of how an acute crisis led him to the practice of Positive Deviance (PD). He tells how he was propelled, over a twelve-year period to develop and amplify the approach, which has enabled communities of more than 2.2 million people in Vietnam to sustain the reduction of childhood malnutrition and has been replicated in 24 other countries around the world. The chapter includes a step-by step approach to positive deviance, a formula for positive deviance, exceptional stories of change within societies, and a "how to" and "what-to-do" approach to positive deviance that could be applied within organizations, institutions, or your own society.”

Sternin, Jerry (2003) *Workshop/Meeting with LPKP Staff and Village Cadres.*

Summary: “In May of 2003, Save the Children (SC) and a local Indonesian non-governmental organization (LPKP) met with a consultant to explore how Positive Deviance (PD) could be used to build a community- based movement to protect girls from being trafficked into the 'special entertainment industry' (sex industry.) Over the years the project was expanded to 30 villages. This is a near verbatim description of a workshop/meeting that was intended to provide the cadres and LPKP staff with a deeper understanding of the Positive Deviance (PD) approach and to introduce how it could be utilized to address the problem of “girl trafficking” in the community. Instead the session was used as an opportunity to learn how PD can be used to address community problems in general. The rationale for the “detour” away from the issue of girl trafficking was to begin the session by focusing on “neutral” problems rather than to immediately begin with a subject, which is still quite sensitive for some of the village Cadres.”

Sternin, Jerry (2002) ‘Positive deviance: A new paradigm for addressing today’s problems today’, *Journal of Corporate Citizenship*, 5, 57-62. Available at: <http://www.hbs.edu/socialenterprise/pdf/Positive%20Deviance%20description.pdf>

Summary: “This article discusses the use of positive deviants in the development field, arguing against the analysis that the inextricability of underlying causes of behavioural-change-related problems dictates that they must all be addressed before viable solutions can be found. The author writes that positive deviance provides an impetus for action and an accompany strategy and discusses the critical components of the positive devi-

ance approach, providing examples of its use in several development settings. The article also discusses the critical role that positive deviance can play in sustainability.”

Sternin, Jerry and Robert Choo (2000) ‘The Power of Positive Deviancy: An effort to reduce malnutrition in Vietnam offers an important lesson about managing change’, *Harvard Business Review*, January-February, 14-15.

Summary: This article examines Save the Children's work to help the people of Vietnam reduce childhood malnutrition in their rural villages, including a model program that concentrated on finding solutions to malnutrition within affected communities. Working closely with the residents of several villages in Thanh Hoa province, the authors sought out very poor families who had managed to avoid malnutrition. By examining the behaviour of these people, the “positive deviants” in the community, Save the Children found local strategies for combating malnutrition. This article discusses lessons learned and advantages of the positive-deviance approach.

Sternin, M., J. Sternin and D. Marsh (1998) *Designing a Community-Based Nutrition Program Using the Hearth Model and the Positive Deviance Approach - A Field Guide*, Save the Children.

Summary: “This guide is intended for trainers, program officers and managers from NGOs and INGOs or MOH district teams or other organizations working at the grass-roots level, in partnership with the community or through community-based organizations. It has been developed to assist in designing a community-based Nutrition Education and Rehabilitation Program in collaboration with the communities served. More specifically this guide will help to: 1) Assess the feasibility of the nutrition program in the proposed context; 2) Conduct a Situation Analysis of malnutrition with the community; 3) Carry out a Positive Deviance Inquiry with the community and 4) Design a community-based Nutrition Program using Positive Deviance Inquiry findings.”

Tuhus-Dubrow, Rebecca (2009) 'The Power of Positive Deviants: A promising new tactic for changing communities from the inside', *The Boston Globe*, November 29. Available at: <http://rebeccatuhusdubrow.net/2009/11/29/470/>

Summary: This article discusses examples of "positive deviance", an approach to behavioural and social change, noting that by respecting local ingenuity, proponents of the approach say that it galvanizes community members and is often more effective and sustainable than imposing solutions from without. The author discusses the history of positive deviance and recent examples utilizing the approach, as well as the important limitations of positive deviance.

Walzer, Janet (2002) ‘It Takes a Village: Through Positive Deviance, communities are solving their own problems’, *Tufts Health & Nutrition Magazine*.

Summary: “Positive deviance (PD) became a recognized concept in the nutrition community as a result of the work of Tufts nutrition professor Marian Zeitlin in the late 1980s. For those in the field who now use PD, Zeitlin is considered the “pioneer,” says F. James Levinson, director of the International Food and Nutrition Center at the nutri-

tion school. Levinson also notes a resurgence of interest in PD at Tufts in the last couple of years, which reflects the soundness and integrity of the concept and the growing number of students and faculty who relate to its intuitive approach. This article discusses the positive deviance approach within the nutrition community and its focus on success versus failure, recognising this as the driving force behind positive deviance.”

Internet-based resources on positive deviance

Positive Deviance Initiative

<http://www.positivedeviance.org/>

Summary: Affiliated with Tufts University Friedman School of Nutrition Science and Policy, the Positive Deviance Initiative's website offers a comprehensive collection of resources including manuals, slides, videos, both published and anecdotal case studies of PD in practice. The Positive Deviance Initiative (PDI) is a network organization, which is dedicated to amplifying the use of the Positive Deviance (PD) approach to enable communities worldwide to solve seemingly “intractable” problems which require behavioral and social change. By offering workshops, trainings, and convenings, as well as technical support and online resources, the PDI collaborates with many different organizations in various sectors to improve the lives of vulnerable people around the world. This website includes information about positive deviance initiatives and projects, including Preventing Girl Trafficking in Indonesia 2003-2008 and other positive deviance projects with vulnerable populations.

The Power of Positive Deviance

<http://www.powerofpositivedeviance.com/>

Summary: This is the official site for the book *The Power of Positive Deviance*. Renowned management expert, Richard Pascale, and social change pioneers Jerry and Monique Sternin team up to describe their field experiences and the “secret sauce” behind positive deviance. The website includes regularly updated storyboards with images and information that were not included in the book.

World Vision PD/Hearth

<http://www.wvi.org/nutrition/project-models/positive-deviancehearth>

Summary: PD/Hearth is a well-established methodology for sustainably reducing malnutrition in young children using community wisdom. It is one of World Vision's core project models in nutrition. PD/Hearth is a community-based rehabilitation and behaviour change intervention for families with underweight preschool children. The positive deviance approach is used to identify behaviours practiced by the mothers or caretakers of well-nourished children from poor families and to transfer such positive practices to others in the community with malnourished children. The 'Hearth' or home is the location for the nutrition education and rehabilitation sessions. This website provides key

resources with “how-to” details and support in using a positive deviance approach, as well as impact reports on positive deviance projects.

References

- Clawson, V. (2002). *Application of the positive deviance approach to anti-trafficking programming in Nepal – a trial in Nuwakot district*. Nepal: Save the Children.
- Different and Equal (2015). *Falling through the cracks. The trafficking of men and boys in Albania*. Tirana: Different and Equal.
- Durà, L. & Singhal, A. (2009). Utilizing a positive deviance approach to reduce girls' trafficking in Indonesia – asset-based communicative acts that make a difference. *Journal of Creative Communications*, 4(1), 1–17.
- Marsh, D., Schroeder, D., Dearden, K., Sternin, J. & Sternin, M. (2006). The power of positive deviance. *British Medical Journal*, 329, 1177–1179.
- Pascale, R. Sternin, J. & Sternin, M. (2010). *The Power of Positive Deviance: How Unlikely Innovators Solve the World's Toughest Problems*. Harvard Business PressPrint.
- Save the children (no date). Preventing Girl Trafficking Indonesia, Indonesia: Save the Children. Retrieved from http://www.positivedeviance.org/projects/vulnerable_groups.html?id=126
- Sparks, D. (2004). From hunger aid to school reform: An interview with Jerry Sternin. *Journal of Staff Development*, 25(1). Retrieved from <http://www.nsd.org/library/publications/jsd/sternin251.cfm>
- Sternin, J. (2003). *Workshop/Meeting with LPKP Staff and Village Cadres*.

Preventing human trafficking

This document discusses our experiences in developing and implementing a trafficking prevention project, inspired by and drawing on a particular approach to behavioural and social change called "positive deviance". It is intended as a resource for practitioners working in the field of trafficking prevention who are considering implementing a similar approach or methodology.



Fafo

P.O.Box 2947 Tøyen
N-0608 Oslo
www.fafo.no

Fafo-report 2015:22
ISBN 978-82-324-0207-6
ISSN 0801-6143
Order no. 20427